

mense, lê op die hoogste R29,99 per week. Vir die res is alle lone wat aan die broodwinners betaal word onder daardie bedrag, tot selfs by R4,99 per week. Dit lyk my is 'n blatante voorbeeld van ekonomiese ongeregtigheid. Wat die kerk sal moet doen is om alles in sy vermoë te doen om te probeer om daardie soort van ekonomiese ongeregtigheid te verander sodat ekonomiese geregtigheid kan geskied, en dan het ons byvoorbeeld nie maar net gesê dat ons inligting moet insamel sodat mense kan weet wat aangaan nie, ons het besluit om met die boere te gaan praat om te kyk of hulle nie hulle plaaswerkers beter wil betaal nie, ons het ook besluit om die Regering te nader om te vra of hulle nie die regte van plaaswerkers op een of ander manier in wetgewing wil vaslê, sodat daardie mense nie absoluut vir wind en weer oorgelaat word en sulke soort van lone kry nie. Dit is byvoorbeeld 'n voorbeeld daarvan.

Dankie, dr. Boesak.

VOORSITTER: Dr. Boesak, dan sê ons vir u dankie vir u bydrae, en u word verskoon sodat u nog betyds u vliegtuig kan haal. --- Baie dankie.

THE COMMISSION IS ADJOURNED.

THE COMMISSION RESUMES:

MMUTLANYANE STANLEY MOGOBA, declares under oath:

ADV. SOLOMON: Reverend Mogoba, you have prepared a curriculum vitae and written statement to the Commission. Can you just take us very briefly through your curriculum vitae please? --- Yes, as stated in the original curriculum vitae I was born in Sekhukhuniland, and I was educated there in primary education, but at the age of 13 I came to

Pretoria, and studied at Kilnerton High School not very far from here. This was my first initiation into a multiracial community. Then I went to a teacher training college also in Pretoria, the Pretoria Bantu Normal College, and perhaps one part of my life which is included in the curriculum vitae which might be of interest is the fact that I was detained for eight months and later sentenced to Robben Island for three years.

Was that a significant - well obviously it was a significant period in your life, but for what particular other reason was that a significant period during your life? --- It was significant because this is where I experienced a very intense conversion, and my life thereafter has never been quite the same. 10

Spiritual conversion? --- Spiritual conversion.

CHAIRMAN: Of what were you convicted and sentenced?

--- Allegations under the Unlawful Organisations' Act.

The allegation was that I was a member of the Pan Africanist Congress, which I wasn't really at the time.

ADV. SOLOMON: Yes? --- And I want to say that probably one thing that comes out of my experience at that time was the experience of very intense suffering both for myself and for my family, but because of this experience that I have referred to, I was able to cope as it were with very very difficult feelings and emotions within me. This possibly explains why one of the things that I always say almost on every platform is the whole question of reconciliation in our South African context. Thereafter perhaps I could mention the fact that I was associated with the Federal Theological Seminary which was in Alice, and it 20 30

was / ...

was at this time again that I was exposed to a multiracial community, perhaps one of the very few such unique opportunities for living together in our land.

Now, for the record, what happened to the Federal Theological Seminary in Alice? --- The Federal Theological Seminary in Alice was expropriated by the Government and it had no home, we had to live in tents and caravans and in temporary accommodation until we were resettled in Natal. But both at the Federal Theological Seminary and and at Kilnerton, I experienced removal, which is why 10  
again I had been very very early in noticing the suffering that can come as a result of removals in our land. Then I was a teacher at the Federal Theological Seminary until I was elected to the position of secretary of our Church, the position I assumed at the beginning of last year.

Your Church being the Methodist Church of South Africa? --- The Methodist Church of Southern Africa.

And you are at present the general secretary of the Church, is that right? --- Yes, that is right.

Now, what do your duties and functions entail as 20  
general secretary of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa? --- I am the head administrator of the Church, Sir, and because our Church has got the tradition of having heads as presidents who only hold office for one year, the general secretary is the one man who really holds things together from one president to the other.

Now, in your capacity as such do you come into contact with the senior and junior clergy in the Methodist Church? --- That is correct, yes.

Do you have close contact with them? --- I have close 30  
contact / ...

contact with all the clergy and in fact all the problems of the Church come via my office one way or the other.

And would you therefore regard yourself as being in a good position to assess the views of the clergy within this Church? --- That is correct, Sir.

Now, do you have much contact with the Black grass root views in South Africa? --- Yes, I live in KwaMashu presently, which is an ordinary African township, so that I see what happens inside a Black township at very very close quarters, and I could say really I have always had 10 a very very close link with the grass roots of our Church. In our Methodist Church I was the chairman of the Black Methodist Consultation, which was trying as it were to bring the feelings of the Blacks within the Methodist Church to the notice or to the level of Conference where it could be noticed by the leadership of our Church.

And I presume that you also travel fairly extensively throughout South Africa? --- That is correct.

In connection with your job. Do you therefore come into contact with clergymen of all races and people of all 20 races throughout South Africa? --- That is correct, not only clergy but I would say members of congregations all over.

Do you feel that you have so to speak your finger on the pulse of the feeling of the members of the Methodist Church with regard to the South African Council of Churches? --- That is correct, Sir.

You of course also in your capacity as general secretary are aware of decisions taken within this Church by the officials? --- That is correct, Sir. 30

Now / ...

Now, you have prepared a statement in writing which is in three sections together with annexures from which I gather you will make certain extracts. Would you take his Lordship and the Commission through your statement please? --- Thank you, Sir. I refer to page 2 of my submission: The South African Council of Churches as the last hope for South Africa:

"It is difficult to remain silent when the SACC is fighting for its life especially when one holds strong views that Christianity is the only force that can save this country from imminent self-destruction. Many people in our country would laugh at this claim because they believe that some ideology or some superior military force will ensure our future peace and happiness. My submission, M'lord, is that we ignore the clear message of history at our peril. Human frailty, human sin will wreak destruction of life where it is ignored.-

10

and, M'lord, may I ask for the deletion of that "or" and the insertion of a full stop at that point, Sir.

20

"Christianity takes human sins seriously and provides a solution proclaimed by Mark: 'Repent for the Kingdom of God is at hand'.

Our plural society with its racial problems compounded over three centuries has deep-seated fears, suspicion, mistrust and hatred that no political theory can dissolve. It is, however, the claim of our Christian faith that it has the power to do just that. The South African Council of

30

Churches of which my Church is a member, represents and epitomises the Christian contribution to the solution of our problems in this land.

Allegations have been made that the South African Council of Churches' thinking has been shaped or dictated by foreign forces of a non-Christian nature.

Looking at papers that I have read and given at various gatherings in the last ten years, there is a consistent cry for reconciliation and the urgent need for a National Convention. These appeals were 10 because they represent the feelings of a majority of people in this land. These people may appear silent but we who live and move within the Black community and meet a fair percentage of Whites know that these cries are genuine and sincere.

It would be a real tragedy if the White fellow countrymen were to ignore these longings of the heart of so many people whose love for this country and the God who created it are absolutely beyond question. 20

South African Council of Churches seen through Black Eyes:

One of the harsh realities about South Africa is that we are a fragmented society. This is so real that some things cause 'storm and fury' to a section of the nation when the other section remains calm and even oblivious to that tremor. The SACC question is one such issue. It is largely a 'White Question' which features prominently on the radio. The concern and anger aroused by the SACC is beamed on the South 30

African nation as if it were a major international catastrophe. The broadcasts on the Black vernacular radios inflicts this subject on an audience that wonders why such a non-issue should be sung to them ad nauseam. To most of them the subject bores them to the marrow.

To understand this reaction let me attempt to portray the SACC as it is known to the majority of Black South Africans. The work of the SACC is seen as an act of prophecy, an act of compassion, an act of caring, an act of witness, and also as a sign of hope.

10

As an act of prophecy, the God of our Bible is not an absentee landlord. One of the outstanding features about Him is that He refuses to be silent even when silence would have brought 'peace' or salved the conscience of many. The voice of the Prophet of God was uncomfortable to an Israel that had turned away from God. The Prophet Micah's classical epitome of the prophetic message seems to have been composed for South Africa:

20

What does the Lord require of you but to do justice, and to love kindness and to walk humbly with your God.

Most of the sins of the SACC seem to be related to frequent reference to, or emphasis of, this message, which thing causes irritation, even chagrin, to some of our fellow-countrymen.

And yet we Blacks see injustice writ large across our horizon.

30

I recall a young child's remark when he saw a beautiful school in town with all the wonderful facilities: Why is our school not like that one? And somebody in the same car said: even children can see that there is something wrong with our society. There are no 'agitators' required to stir up people. If they have eyes and can appreciate beauty, the situation is enough to agitate them. The trouble with our country is that we want to hide behind scapegoats. When I was still at the Federal Theological Seminary I remember that the Seminary was called all sorts of names and even held responsible for the troubles at Fort Hare. The result was that the Federal Seminary was expropriated and it found a new home in Natal nearly 600 km away. The troubles at Fort Hare continued. Two years later the Soweto disaster erupted, but the situation around where the Federal Seminary was now stationed remained relatively quiet. What a price and at what a sacrifice.

This Fed Sem tragedy illustrates the possible explanation of the image of the South African Council of Churches at this moment. It is the largest body bang at the door of Soweto and it is expected to be silent. That is impossible. To be true to its calling the SACC has been understandably vocal on many issues and the international Christian community has expressed its approval and joy. Having attended a few World Council of Churches meetings, I feel confident that the only remedy for

those people who are so critical of the SACC is to send them to at least one World Council of Churches meeting. It is easy and comfortable to make domestic noises at a safe distance from the main body of Christian thinking where one's assumptions and idiosyncrasies cannot be tested in the glaring light of modern biblical scholarship. The churches have always tried to interpret, through God's grace, Christ's ministry of compassion. This means standing where the suffering masses stand, sharing their suffering and trying to remedy or lessen it. This again cannot be done at a safe distance of an inner city or suburban church. One of the monumental tasks of the SACC has been to highlight the suffering of the depressed people - migratory labour, re-locations, squatters, refugee problem, to name but a few. I challenge the critics of the SACC to go and pitch their tents within these communities and speak from there rather than from their posh homes and churches. Many of our White Christians have never seen the inside of our urban townships, let alone the rural and depressed areas. Some have only seen them from the national roads, convenient modern bypass of towns and communities at a maximum speed of 100 km an hour.

An act of caring. Through the years the SACC has helped to promote community projects through the Inter Church Aid. It has helped to provide water in some areas, to establish home industries, garden projects, health projects, literacy campaigns - you

10

20

30

name it."

I could say here, M'lord, that I was personally involved in some of the projects at the local level, when I was still in the Eastern Cape in conjunction with the Border Council of Churches.

"It is not difficult to imagine how baffled the people in these communities become when they hear their radio represent the SACC as 'a den of iniquity'. The blind man said of Jesus: 'I do not know if he is a sinner, but one thing I know is I was blind and now I see'.

10

An act of witness: Many young people who would not have been able to further their studies have been assisted through the many scholarships offered by the SACC. Many theological seminaries have been assisted in many ways by the SACC. Many independent churches, despite their recent attempts to besmirch the name of the SACC, have actually been assisted by the SACC. Thus the leadership of the Black churches has benefited in one way or the other from the SACC. The thrust of the ecumenical movement has been the main concern of the SACC. In this way the SACC has been seen as an act of witness to the unity of the Triune God.

20

Finally, as a sign of hope, Christianity in Southern Africa has been going through a severe test. The close association between White politics and many Christian churches has left a dent in the integrity and credibility of the Christian religion.

The involvement of the SACC in the Black Theology

30

Movement / ...

Movement, Defence and Aid Fund, and in the Dependants' Conference has helped to redeem the tarnished image of the Church. The constant cry of the SACC has been to let justice not only be done but be seen to be done. The plight of the families of political prisoners can only be vividly felt when one visits the families to see what they are going through.

One of the compliments paid to the SACC is the attempt to identify it with the ANC. That has given it a real boost in the eyes of the Blacks and of the international community. Travelling in a train one day in Europe I met some Blacks who became hostile to me as soon as they discovered that I was a South Africa, but when they found out that I had something to do with the SACC and the WCC their hardened faces warmed up with a smile and one of them said: 'You know Bishop Tutu? That is a real Christian'. Now these young people did not know Bishop Tutu in person but they knew of him. Even in South Africa he has become a household name. Ordinary people who have seen actual help being given to innocent as well as 'convicted' victims of our racial 'cold war' now have a different view of the Church. After all the Christian Church is the only truly national institution in Southern Africa that has survived and that speaks for a united community of God's people.

Thus the SACC is a sign of hope and that there might be a secure future for all our diverse people in

this / ...

this beautiful Southern Africa that God has given to us. One day when the history of South Africa is written down, when our fears and mistrust shall have melted away, the real heroes and true servants of God shall emerge and the SACC will be seen in a more favourable light and the prophets of doom shall be relegated to oblivion.

In my opening paragraphs, M'lord, I referred to an allegation that the SACC does not think independently or that it is manipulated by the WCC or some foreign ideology. I cannot see any evidence for this claim. 10

Christians in our country have always expressed their mind independently and have sought to interpret their Christianity in the best possible manner according to their understanding of the Scriptures. This goes right back to the days of Dr. John Phillip and the Ethiopian Independent Churches.

Christians have occupied positions of leadership in the nation from the very earliest days, for example immediately after the first National Convention and the formation of the Union of South Africa which excluded Blacks particularly the Africans. 20

M'lord, I now wish to refer to my own writings which show a close similarity between ideas expressed by the SACC. Blacks, in particular, have a fairly common approach in their interpretation of Christian theology and ethical practice. I recall a meeting in Hammanskraal called by the SACC to formulate a South African response to the Programme to combat 30

Racism. The views of the Blacks were similar and this cut across denominational boundaries.

The meeting came up with the call to form a Black Confessing Church. There was no 'incitement' from the officials and staff of the SACC.

In fact, M'lord, I wanted to say that the General Secretary of the SACC was criticised very severely at the beginning of this meeting because of the manner in which he tried to speak very compassionately towards the Dutch Reformed Church. A letter had been written to the Dutch Reformed Churches inviting them to participate. They did not and in fact wrote a letter which was not very very encouraging, and the meeting felt that the General Secretary of the SACC was bending over too much towards the DRC, so that he could not possibly have given a lead in this area, just in that particular meeting he was in fact trying to include as much of the church communities of Africa as was possible at the time. And as I have said the people who came to this meeting came from all the churches, they were not the normal representatives at SACC meetings, most of them were people who had come there possibly for the first time to meet in such a gathering. But when the debates were over it seemed quite clear that there was consensus cutting across denominational areas, and this again right down the divide between Black and White Christians.

10

20

"There was no pressure from outside. What emerged was a unique South African response to the racial situation in our churches and in our land".

Now, M'lord, I do not intend to say much about the documents themselves, I have already said that the main

30

purpose / ...

purpose of submitting these documents was merely to show that the feelings, some of the ideas expressed are fairly widespread and that they have been there for quite some time. I have referred here to writings which cover ten years almost, and my feelings are that sometimes when some ideas are criticised from the SACC it is forgotten that these ideas are actually there in the South African nation and the South African Church.

"In Document A, M'lord, written as early as 1972 a report is given of a Theological Seminary Symposium on Black Theology. This symposium was a forthright debate as I can remember with strong views expressed on all sides. There was no SACC in sight. Students were undertaking a theological exercise during the days when young students in universities, colleges and schools were seriously rejecting the Christian religion as a White man's religion. And it was these serious debates which, I believe, saved Christianity for our Sub-Continent. I refer also to document A2 which does not appear very clearly on my paper, it is pages 13 and 15 of the submission. This is the paper that I gave as an inaugural address at the Federal Seminary in February 1973. The main essence of this paper was to try and make the people aware of the dynamics of our age, particularly the ideological war between East and West, and the fact that the Third World is really being pulled between the forces that are at work. I had discovered that many people were not clearly aware of what was going on, they / ...

they were very simplistic in their interpretation of most of the events in South Africa and in the world.

Of course we still find some, particularly when you discuss what is happening in Zimbabwe today, you still find people who really just interpret things as they are and they don't see the dynamics, they don't see the real forces that are operating behind what is going on there. But what comes out very clearly in this submission, M'lord, is that at this point I came up with the idea which I held 10 to, I think, throw out, that as I saw it only the Church can really save this country, and by and large other things are just short term solutions but basically when you talk of reconciliation it is the Church that will have to play an important part to save this country, or otherwise this country will be doomed.

"In Document B, 'Our Beloved Seminary', I react here to the expropriation of the Federal Theological Seminary, and as I said earlier the problem of removals as a national problem has been with us 20 for some time. I had experienced it at Kilnerton, I was experiencing it for the first time and Dimbaza was not very far from where we were, and we were experiencing it there too.

In Document C - 'The Church in Future South Africa' which is pages 13 following, this was written in 1975 and here attention is drawn to the need to be prophetic, consistent, sensitive, active, reconciling and reaching out with a note of urgency to all people. The release of political prisoners and the compelling 30 urgency / ...

urgency of calling a National Convention were appeals that were particularly stressed.

In Document D - 'Wesley in the Market Place' - pages 22 - 29 - I refer to John Wesley's passion for saving souls and for an Evangelism that reached out to redeem the sinner and the situations of oppression.

I do not intend to quote anything from this at this stage, M'lord, because I am aware that this Commission has been given a lot of this by Mr. Storey, but in that document I quote what I have discovered from the position of John Wesley himself through the journals of John Wesley, and there is a lot of evidence in those journals of John Wesley about what he thought about social issues of the day. 10

"In Document E - 'Theological Education in Africa' pages 30 and 32 of my submission - I emphasise that the Gospel in Africa at this stage will need theological educators who will train ministers and therefore congregations and I stress in that document the importance of Catholicity of the Church, the authenticity of the Gospel and also how all this should really result in an inspiring creativity amongst the Black people in particular in our land. 20

In Document F - pages 33 to 41 - 'What does it mean to be a Christian son in South Africa' I stress that Christian sonship must be understood in the context of the family of the children of God and claims that sonship means at least eight things: unity, obedience, freedom, love, sharing, learning, working and creativity.

In Document G - pages 42 to 48 - 'How the Church should / ... 30

should be involved in the struggle for a just society', an attempt is made to analyse the question of hope in our Christian ministry. I try to highlight the importance of human dignity, education, labour problems, unity (Church and national) and also the question of development. In Document G2 - 'Looking at South Africa from Outside' - pages 49 and 50. This was a paper I wrote immediately after attending a few conferences overseas, and I was trying to report about what South Africa looks like from outside, and here I particularly emphasise the whole problem of racism on page 49, the South African race problem, how widespread it is, how it affects El Salvador, Nicaragua Chile, Argentina, Korea, India, the Untouchables in India, the Aborigines in Australia, the Maori of New Zealand, the Tamil of Sri Lanka, the Dene in Canada, the Palestinians, the Haiti, the Philippines, the Afghan, and that this racism is fairly widespread and the World Church looks at it, at the manifestation of racism all over the world, but that in particular the South African racism is unique in that whereas the other countries in the world would like to deny that racism takes place in their own countries, in South Africa it is not only denied but it is actually official policy and is enshrined in the Constitution and the Statute books, which makes South Africa a polecat.

I want to illustrate this, at the world meeting on Mission and Evangelism in Melbourne Australia were delegates from Russia / ...

Russia, and it was interesting during the discussion that they were very defensive when the question of Afghanistan came up, because here in the World Council of Churches there is no part of the world that escapes review and criticism. However when this came up they became very sensitive, but at one point some people compared Russia and South Africa, and I have never seen people turn and change so completely, change colour and lose their temper and rave, actually say they have been insulted to be compared with South Africa, and to me that brought the point home that in an international community we are quite unique and even people like Russia who do the things they did in Afghanistan think that they are much better than we are.

10

"Then, M'lord, in the final Document H - 'The Church is an Agent of Reconciliation in an Age of Revolution', I endeavour to show the importance of Christian ministry of reconciliation, and particular stress is made of the fact that reconciliation is costly, it is not easy, it is unavoidable and it is not theoretical. I refer here particularly to page 53 of the insertion where this point of reconciliation comes up again.

20

M'lord, in all these papers which span nearly ten years I am trying to show that Christian theology in our land has come of age and has come to stay. The South African Council of Churches has taken the stand it has taken because it represents a cross-section of a very wide spectrum of theological thinking in our land. What is more, it stands as a

30

beacon / ...

beacon of hope for many people in our land".

Now, Reverend, just to clear up one point before I ask further questions, on the top of page 4.1 of your submission you refer to - in the first and second lines - Defence and Aid Fund, is that the Asingeni Fund which you are referring to? --- No - yes and no.

Could you just explain that? --- I refer to all the help that is given to the families of the people who have suffered in one way or the other particularly those who do not have a breadwinner as a result of the situation in our land, the work of the Dependants' Conference is focused mainly on this, but the Asingeni Fund is another related aspect because the whole question of defence and related issues cannot really be completely separated. 10

Can you enlarge upon what you said a moment ago about families who do not have the assistance which they might otherwise have because of the situation in South Africa. In what way are they assisted? --- They are assisted, M'lord, in that they are given a small little grant which helps them to buy some groceries and sometimes a situation arises when they cannot even get school fees for their children, and they are helped in this area also. 20

C4

Now is this the dependants of people who are incarcerated for socalled political crimes? --- This is the families of all the people who are incarcerated or detained and yes, I would say that is what it is.

Now, you mentioned that you were involved with the Border Council of Churches, we have seen from your curriculum vitae that you are also the national vice-chairman of the Dependants' Conference. Have you as such experienced / ... 30

experienced at close quarters the sort of relief which this provides to people in this position? --- Yes, M'lord, when I was in Pietermaritzburg in particular, I was able to have a very close contact with the families, because sometimes I would assist a worker there to actually go to the families to see what state they were in and to help them with one little thing or the other, and I realised the real suffering which these people are experiencing and I don't see how any Christian could really continue to call himself a Christian and not feel a sense of compassion towards these people. I don't think this is a political matter, I think it is just Christian duty. 10

Now, you mentioned that in the Eastern Cape you were near to Dimbaza? --- That is correct.

Did you see for yourself the conditions at Dimbaza? --- Yes, the conditions at Dimbaza particularly immediately they were dumped there and after the Reverend David Russell had been active in that area, the conditions were really shocking. 20

And did you see the sort of assistance which the South African Council of Churches was giving to the people there in one form or another? --- Yes, I was involved there a great deal in trying to see what we could do there. I must say that we didn't do very much to start with because the problem was really a very big one.

And was there a lack of funds? --- A lack of adequate funds to do this, but there was a little bit of relief given, and we were able to witness by being there, because that is another way of witnessing, by merely looking / ... 30

looking at the situation and finding out and sometimes being able to give help.

Now, from what you have experienced and witnessed in this regard, if these sort of activities of the South African Council of Churches are curtailed due to a deprivation of funds or any other way, what sort of results do you think that will have upon the beneficiaries of these activities? --- I believe that this would dash their hopes and they would feel completely let down by a Christian country which has stopped what was a Christian duty to them. Because when this happens there is no way in which the various churches in this country as they presently are constructed can be of any real help to these people. They depend a great deal on whatever help they can get and if this stops I think they would feel completely let down, and I fear for this country because when there is a sign of hope in the minds of very many people it makes them feel that there might be change, something might happen, but if a thing like the SACC is interfered with, I feel that that would be really saying to the country and to the nation that well, we are not even prepared to give this which I think is a minimum duty of every Christian.

10

20

So it would be an enormous emotional and spiritual blow to these people and presumably it would also be an enormous physical blow to these people? --- That is correct.

Who rely upon this sort of support for their physical wellbeing? --- Entirely, yes.

Now, we have heard on a number of occasions that the vast majority of the funding for the South African Council

30

of Churches and its activities comes from overseas, and a relatively small proportion comes from its member churches in South Africa. Speaking for your church, is your church able to increase its contribution in monetary terms to the South African Council of Churches? --- Not significantly. The churches as they are presently constituted do not have the means, and every year our Conference feels that it should increase its giving to the South African Council of Churches, but this year we were only able to increase it by R500 to R2 000, and that is just peanuts in relation to the demands that would be made on the SACC. 10

Now why is it that your church is unable to provide a more substantial contribution, why is it that they lack the funds to provide more money? --- Because a great majority of the membership of our church is poor, they just are not able to provide the local needs of the church, and in fact our church finds that it cannot even build enough churches for its members, some of our members are worshipping in classrooms and under trees and so on, we don't have enough money, which is why we have launched the centenary appeal where we hope to get a little bit of money, but that is nothing compared with what would be required. 20

I take it then that if the South African Council of Churches loses the sources of funds which it at present has your church would not in any sense be able to step into the breach? --- That is quite correct.

Now, we have heard that you are in close contact with Black views and Black people in South Africa, leaving your church / ... 30

church aside for the moment, what impact do you think it would have upon the views of the Black people with whom you have contact if the South African Council of Churches is as has been recommended by one of the witnesses, declared an affected organisation? --- This would provoke a lot of anger and frustration and I think very many people would find themselves doing desperate things merely because of what has happened to the SACC. I believe that the SACC is really there to help save the country as I said earlier. It is a beacon of hope and if that were dashed I don't see how else we could hope to carry the bulk of the people in our country with us.

10

Does your church support the South African Council of Churches in its activities? --- That is correct, yes, we are founder members of the South African Council of Churches and we have remained members throughout.

And has your church kept its finger on the pulse with regard to these activities and taken a close interest in the involvement of the South African Council of Churches in its socio-political activities? --- Yes, our church takes an interest in what the SACC does, it appoints every year members to the annual conference of the SACC. We appoint at conference members to the various divisions of the SACC, and every year we discuss the policy of the SACC and express support or otherwise, and in particular when there were some controversial issues we have had very long debates at conference, but all these are reflected in our minutes where we express our support for the work of the SACC.

20

So if the South African Council of Churches acts in

30

the / ...

the view of your church outside its mandate, would your church repudiate the South African Council of Churches? --- Yes it would repudiate it as an organ, but I think we would also realise that it is part of the SACC, we don't have the feeling that the SACC is something apart from us, we would take the blame because we are part of the decisions that are made through our representatives.

By the way what is the approximate number of the membership of the Methodist Church of South Africa? --- The membership as we have it we reckon is a quarter of a million, but the membership as a whole, one would think that is the people who are adherents that is people who really are not regular members but they go under the label Methodist, we go very very nearly to half a million, and some statistics say that we have more than a million but we doubt this because in terms of our records we only have a quarter of a million.

10

Thank you, M'lord.

CHAIRMAN: Well it is four o'clock, I think we should call it a day.

20

ADV. VON LIERES: It would have been of some assistance if we had been told that certain witnesses require to depart today, then these witnesses could have been offered before the Commission in such a way that they could have been disposed of. We have only been placed in possession of Reverend Mogoba's documentation this morning. In the circumstances I will start my cross-examination of the witness but I don't know how long it is going to take, it may be lengthy, there are certain documents that I need to deal with but I will see how far I get.

30

Chairman / ...

CHAIRMAN: Perhaps there is a factor that does come into it and that is that I think I did intimate to the attorney for the South African Council of Churches that we contemplated long sitting hours. However, let us see how far you can get. Might I just enquire, until when will you be available to give evidence, when does your plane leave in other words? --- At 6.15.

Well, we will see how far you can get.

ADV. VON LIERES: Reverend Mogoba, you addressed a meeting of SACLA in 1979 on the topic "Challenges to Christian Leadership in a polarised situation"? --- That is correct.

10

One of the points you made there that I would like to discuss with you is you made the statement that "the Church herself is in dire need of being rescued". This statement was made in connection with the part of your address concerning the polarised church. Do you recall that? --- I do, yes.

Can you explain to the Commission what the circumstances were or what the position is from which the Church required to be rescued? --- Yes, Sir. The point I made there is I think a point I made also in my presentation elsewhere, and that is that the Church in our land has been identified a great deal with the social order. The leadership of the Church in particular has been White, and as I think has been said earlier in this Commission, that the Church needs to distance itself from the social order in order that it can be prophetic and not be part of it so that it cannot really be prophetic in the situation. And what I meant by the Church being rescued,

20

30

is / ...

is that in this Church unless the Church becomes the Church, it is likely to be treated as just a political party or a political ideology, and that the Church needs to be the Church.

But now, from what must it be rescued, from a false dogma that it pronounces on or supports, or from what must it be rescued? --- Yes, from the - well I would say false dogmas and also from over-identification with the social order to a point where it cannot really be the Church. I mean if a church in this land looks like our social order, then this affects the message of the Church and the Church can therefore not really be the Church. And as I said earlier people have long been identifying the Church with as it were the White part of our - or the Western World or the White part of our population here in South Africa.

10

Now, does this mean that you do not find the Western theological imprint on the Church as being relevant to the South African scene? --- I would say it is not helpful.

20

And this sort of approach, what Dr. Boesak described earlier this morning as the Western universality, should be replaced by something to make it helpful? --- Yes, it should be modified and looked into, yes.

In what way or in what manner do you see that to rescue the Church, that its dogma - no, let me put it slightly differently. The present dogma is not helpful you say, if I can simplify or over-simplify it slightly, helpful for what purpose? --- I think it is not helpful in that it is not critical enough and particularly being

30

critical / ...

critical of itself. One of the, I think redeeming features of the Black Theology Movement I would say amongst other things is the fact that it brought in a self-criticalness which made the Church able to look into itself, to assess itself and to criticise itself and to ask questions which are pertinent questions which perhaps could have been avoided but to try and reach out to them.

Now, you yourself are you an exponent of this Black Theology Movement? --- Yes, I have said so in one of the documents I have here.

10

I haven't read them yet? --- I have given a paper on Black Theology, but that is not the only paper, it is just that I was trying to give a few papers that were given in the last ten years, there are several papers that I gave on the subject, Sir.

So when you make the statement that the Church is in dire need of being rescued, we must then understand that this statement is made from the perspective that you are of the view that Black Theology is a more relevant theology to the South African circumstance than the theology that the churches were offering at that particular time? --- I would say that, yes.

20

Now, in what sense do you say that Black Theology is more relevant to the South African circumstance, what does it achieve or what can it achieve that the dogma that it should substitute cannot achieve? --- I think it achieves a sense of identification with the Christian faith. Where there was rejection of the Christian faith, Black Theology comes to say criticism of the Church is not necessarily a criticism of Christ and of the Gospel, but these are two

30

different things. You could criticise the Church as it is presently constituted, but by that it does not necessarily mean that the Church as it is presently constituted represents the totality of the Gospel message that Christ gave. The pertinent questions which are asked by Black Theology are why did God create me as I am? Was I really created in the image of God? Did Christ really come to save me, and what is the effect of that to the social order and daily living from Monday to Monday. And I believe that these are the questions that have been asked and as soon as they are asked they call for an answer and an analysis of the entire understanding of our Christian religion. 10

Is that so because Black Theology contributes to the creating of awareness amongst the constituent members of the Church? --- Amongst other things I would say it is awareness, but more than that I think it really means that people who call themselves Christians really take it up seriously and not say that this is the Christianity that we got from the West, they say this is our Christianity, we believe that Christ came to save us, came to save me, and that is a very serious statement to make, and when a man becomes aware of that he becomes a Christian I believe. But the situation that existed before which made people really just nominal Christians who believed that: well, we are in the process of being Christianised, or: can this really be Christianity, why is it the same as Western civilisation, why is it that what is happening in the entire Western world seems to have put its imprint on the Christian religion. 20

The relevance of Black Theology as you understand it, 30  
does / ...

does it have the effect that it makes people - the people towards whom it is directed aware of who they are, where they are, what they should do, how they should live, what they should aim for? --- I would say so because basically it is human dignity, it is really saying: take yourself seriously, you are created in the image of God, you are something, and I think from that flows a lot of things.

So could we just conclude this little bit, the rescue operation of the Church, if I understand you correctly, then would be completed or concluded once the Church is 10 convinced that it has to apply the correct theological interpretation or the correct theological insight that from your perspective it should apply. In other words if it applies the Black Theology instead of the Westernised Theology, then it has liberated itself, the Church? --- I think the process of liberation is an ongoing thing, when it stops you wouldn't become less aware of that than when the liberation stops, so I would say you can't say you have completed it at a particular stage, I think it is an ongoing self-search and an ongoing - being critical in an ongoing 20 way of the type of faith in the past, and that is why we believe that Black Theology is not really meant for Blacks alone, we believe that ultimately it is meant to liberate the Whites, and I think the Whites in this country are in need of liberation and Black Theology can liberate them so that they become human beings.

Can the Church perform its function the way you see that it should perform its function before it has been rescued? --- Yes and no, I believe that in the process of liberating itself it could perform its function, but I 30 don't / ...

don't see the Church ever becoming perfect and that is why I shifted the focus from the Church to Christ. I believe that the focus is Christ and not the Church, so the Church must continually be wanting to be Christ-like, and a state of perfection can never be reached at this stage.

Reverend Mogoba, in the same address then at a later stage you make the statement that in various economic social and political systems in the world "the Church must make a careful choice of the system it supports and then ensure that this system does not fall short of the Christian yardstick". Do you see it - does this sound familiar to you? --- Yes, Sir. 10

Do you see it as the function of the Church to decide which system, whether it is economic, social or political, it should support, or do you see it as the function of the Church to identify insufficiencies or problem areas in society and to direct the attention of those who are involved in the secular ordering of society to those problem areas with a view that they take action? --- I think it depends on what sort of choice it is, if it is a choice between living and dying and surviving, the Church might feel it has a stake in the matter, but I believe that the function of the Church is to purify systems, cultural systems, political systems, economic systems and thoughts, and that the task of the Church is to purify them so that again they can be Christ-like, they can approach a stage where they could be like Christ. So that whole question of who makes the choice depends on the magnitude of the programme of the choice that has got to be made. 20 30

Theoretically / ...

Theoretically, let us assume that the Church exercises a careful choice as you suggest and it decides to follow system X, and it turns out that system X was the wrong choice, what is the position of the Church then? --- Well I would believe that - again I have said that no institution can be perfect, so when you say when you choose between two systems you choose the one that approximates, that is nearest to your model of a society. Now if your yardstick was Christ at the time when you chose, then I don't think you can ever go wrong because the other one which you have 10 rejected could never have been better than the one that you have chosen, because you have chosen this one and your yardstick was a Christian yardstick.

Yes, but let us just come back to your example here, your statement here relates to a choice that has to be exercised in connection with an economic, social or political system, you see? --- Yes.

That is something different, and what you say is that the choice that the Church exercises must comply or you say must not fall short of the Christian yardstick, 20 but if it does? --- Fall short of the Christian yardstick?

If the results - look, one exercises a moral judgment, one decides system A is better than system B for argument's sake theoretically speaking, that is the exercise of a moral judgment. If this exercise of a moral judgment turns out to be wrong, that because one supports system A one causes a radical transformation of one's society to take place, and at the end of the day the transformation having taken place, the chosen social or economic or political system having been substituted, and 30

it turns out that this chosen system is not better than what one had before, what then is the position of the Church at the end of the day? --- I would believe that if the yardstick was a Christian yardstick and something went wrong there, that would be a judgment on the Church as a whole. I don't think that a choice between two systems, system A and system B, if the Christian yardstick was used, could ever go wrong. If it went wrong it means the other one would have gone even worse - be even worse.

Now, on the same basis somebody who has a different theological perspective or understanding to yours, who has to exercise a choice of a social or an economic or a political system, could exercise on his perception and understanding and meaning of the Gospel on his theology a different choice to yours? --- I am not quite sure if I understand - can you concretise your question a little more? 10

Well, you have told us that from your Black Theology perspective, the Church is in need of being rescued, it needs to take over Black Theology to become relevant if I can put it that way. Now if somebody else, another minister who is not a supporter - not a supporter - who has a different theological perspective to Black Theology, this minister or this church may if it exercises a choice in connection with a system that it wishes to see in the society, it can exercise a choice and identify a system that is different to the one that you identify, do you understand what I am getting at? --- Yes. 20

Now, who is to judge which minister is right or wrong, how does a community know whether A's choice is the right one or whether B's choice is the right one, because 30

both / ...

both choices are based on beliefs that those two parties have as to what is the right and relevant theology?

--- I think I would go right back to their premises and if both claim to be Christian and both are using Christian yardsticks but arrive at a different choice, I would think again there is something wrong there. But this is a very hypothetical case I can see, because I did not I think in any way suggest that the Church should be like a political party and go to the people and ask them to choose, but the purpose of the Church, the function of the Church is to be there to purify the systems that the people choose, and to be prophetic and to continue to challenge human structures and human governments, so that they work themselves to a stage of perfection.

Well I don't want to argue with you, I am just asking you these questions on what you have said there, these are your exact words "in various social, economic and political systems in the world the Church must make a careful choice of the system it supports"? --- That is right.

You see? --- That is right, yes. I would stand by that.

Right. So once you select a system doesn't it automatically follow that you must then promote the acceptance of this system? --- Yes, through extending Christian influence. Where Christian influence stops there will be failure, sin and other things will creep in.

Then another aspect in this address that I would just like to understand is this, you say:

"For / ...

"For too long we have concentrated on a negative side of our plural society, that is on our differences. We have thus obscured the positive side. That is our diversity representing a rich heritage which can be developed for our mutual blessing".

What did you have in mind when you suggested here that the Church concentrated on a negative side of our plural society? --- I meant here that plurality presents two options to man, it is that of saying that we are different and therefore we can enrich our heritage by bringing the various cultures together, or we could say we are cursed by having so many different cultures and begin to be so conscious of the others, one rejecting the other all the time, that you feel cursed by the plural situation in which you are placed. My contention was that I believed that we ought to accept plurality as an enrichment and therefore a blessing rather than a curse, and I believe that if we applied that to the South African situation we would come out the better.

Could you tell the Commission how many motions were put up by the Methodist Church to the National Conference of the South African Council of Churches in 1982? --- I can't remember offhand the number because it is a number that changes from year to year.

Did they put up any resolutions that you can recall? --- Yes our Church passed resolutions at this last Conference, and these resolutions were..(intervention)

I am sorry, Reverend, you may be misunderstanding me. The National Conference of the South African Council of Churches / ...

Churches is held yearly and member churches have the right to submit particular matters to the National Conference for consideration. Did the Methodist Church submit any motions to the National Conference of the South African Council of Churches for consideration in 1982 - in other words not motions at your own Conference but at the South African Council of Churches Conference? --- Not directly, what we do in our Church our social concern, what we call CCD - Christian Citizenship Department - is the one that vets most of the decisions of Conference and interprets them in terms of the SACC policy or otherwise, so we don't specifically at any point in Conference pass resolutions which we are sending to the SACC Conference.

10

What does your CCD - you say they interpret your Church's Conference resolutions? --- Yes.

What happens after they have interpreted them?

--- The head of the CCD, the man who heads that department, is also a representative to the annual Conference of the South African Council of Churches.

Let us assume that there is such a motion that the CCD feels should be submitted to the South African Council of Churches' National Conference, would your representative on the National Conference then put it at the National Conference? --- Yes.

20

But he hasn't got the status that he can bind the Church, your Church? --- No, when the SACC has had its Conference, again the matters are referred to Conference and through our CCD Department we have a debate in the Christian Citizenship Department, we look at these issues again and express opinions for and against.

30

Could / ...

Could you perhaps give the Commission an idea what the income of the Methodist Church is per year? --- That would be a bit difficult for me to say because we are what you call a connectional church but we are also a congregational church and most of the income is at the level of the congregation, so I don't have figures here.

Can you venture a guess? --- I would be hesitant to do that without thinking about it.

You see, it seems to me that if this grass roots support that you talk about exists for this important task 10 that the SACC is performing of liberating them, then surely these grass root constituent members would have no hesitation in making 10 or 20 cents a year available? --- Our experience says that it is difficult.

I mean if they know, if they believe that what is being done is to promote their interests wouldn't they then give gladly? --- I say it is not a question of giving gladly, it is a question of not having enough to give. The demands that the Church makes on its members is quite great at the moment, and it would not be possible to ask 20 them to contribute more.

Just to make certain we understand you, the Defence and Aid Fund that you refer to in your submission is of course a Fund that was in existence long before the Asingeni Fund was established, the Asingeni Fund if I may remind you was established in 1976 following on the Soweto riots, whilst the Defence and Aid Fund already existed from the early sixties? --- That is right, I think so.

And when you refer in your statement to the Commission to the Defence and Aid Fund I take it you refer to that 30

Fund which was then at one stage, the Aid portion of that Fund was banned, and subsequent to that the Dependants' Conference was formed by a number of organisations down in Cape Town in the early sixties, is that correct? --- I think that is correct, yes.

And ultimately the Dependants' Conference was then shall I say in inverted commas "taken over" by the South African Council of Churches, that is the historical position? --- Yes, Sir.

Now, I see in a newspaper clipping from the Natal Mercury of the 24th September 1982, it reports that you were speaking at a workshop organised by Diakonia on how the Church should be involved in the struggle for a just society. Let me first ask you, did you address a meeting at Diakonia on such a topic? --- Yes.

10

During that period. Now one of the statements that you allegedly made here was reported as follows:

"Mr. Mogoba said he believed the Church should become involved in the Trade Union Movement".

--- That is correct, Sir.

20

"He said at present most Church people were scared of the power of the workers and of the trade unions".

When you suggested that the Church should be involved with the trade unions, what function did you have in mind that the Church was to perform in connection with the trade unions if any? --- My view was that the Trade Union Movement is emerging as a real force in our land, and like all forces unless the Church can begin to be operating in it, they are the sort of forces that can never really go

30

along / ...

along the lines that the churches would like to identify with, so that the first reason in my mind was that the Church must be involved in order to purify - like what I said earlier that the Church purifies whatever it is involved in. But secondly, and this is purely a Methodist feeling, we believe that in a sense the founder of our Church was a trade unionist, and that he actually gave birth to the Trade Union Movement. I think the only regret is that the Church didn't continue to be as active as it was, and therefore the Trade Union Movement in England for instance began to take a fairly different direction, that the concern for the worker, the concern for the working conditions was something that the founder of our Church, the leader of our Church, was identified with from the very early days. Part of it is in my submission on page 25.

10

Is the idea of the Church getting involved with the Trade Union Movement linked in any way, Reverend, to a thought that the Church should exercise its pastoral diaconian prophetic functions? --- I would say so and to bring reconciliation between the employers and employees.

20

In that sense then the Church would be able to exercise a direct influence on such movements? --- I would think so, yes.

Now, in the same newspaper clipping you are also reported as having appealed for greater Africanisation of the churches, and it is said here that you cited the use of drums in worship as a way of making Christianity real for believers. Could you just explain this to us, firstly did you say this? --- I think so, yes, it is in

30

line with my thinking.

What is the idea behind that thinking, what are you trying to get at? --- The idea of Africanisation is actually much more than drum beating, the beating of drums is just part of it.

Well this is just how it was reported? --- Allright, I'll expand it a little bit, the base of it is that the Christian Church has got to be accepted as a faith that the Africans can identify with very closely. What has happened in the entire African Continent I would be bold 10 to say, is that the missionaries came in and told the Africans to change and become Christians, and they had to change their clothes, they had to change everything, and the missionaries actually believed that they had completely removed from the Africans their traditional religion and their traditional customs, and in the African sense religion was a whole thing that involved the whole of life, it took in culture, it took in religion, it took in everything. Now to imagine that you would change people by making them Christians and accepting what they say when 20 they say: we have changed, was rather naïve of our ancestors in the faith, the missionaries, because very many Africans have not changed, and this is tested whenever an African faces a crucial situation in the home or something like that. He will consult a minister, he will consult an inyanga, he will go to a faith healer, and still not go away from the Church, so that we believe that something has gone wrong there in the appropriation of the faith by the Africans. Now Africanisation means that we are trying to find that which does not make the past and the 30

present / ...

present one, that which makes sort of a bar so that the Christian religion cannot penetrate through. That is one area. The other area of course is trying to make worship a little more African, in fact in churches like the Methodist Church the African Church is Africanised in worship, there is a different worship style in the White Church and in the African Church. But more than that, that also goes into the leadership of the Church, people don't identify with the Church as long as its leadership continues to be a leadership which is White, and we believe that in a multiracial church like for instance the Methodist Church, you would need multi-racial leadership and that would represent the component part of the Church. And so that Africanisation really covers a whole gamut of concerns. 10

Reverend, do you see the Church as having a pivotal role in effecting the fundamental change that Black Theology calls for? --- I think so, yes.

It has by its very nature and structure - the Church by its very nature and structure is, as I think a previous witness told the Commission, in the "communication business" - in inverted commas. Would you agree with that? --- I would agree, yes. 20

And that it therefore has the facility, especially at local congregational level, to bring the message across if it so wishes to do, would you agree with that? --- Yes.

No further questions.

ADV. SOLOMON: No re-examination.

MR. BARRIE: Reverend Mogoba, would you please turn to page 47. At the bottom of the page you refer to an address delivered / ... 30

delivered by Dr. Julius Nyerere, do you know the date and the venue? --- I can't remember offhand.

Could you let us have it please - is it possible to let us have it?

CHAIRMAN: Could you write a letter to the secretary of the Commission giving the date and the venue? --- I think I can trace it. I did not attend this meeting, it is reported in a book, so I think I can trace it and give the information.

Thank you, that is all, thank you very much for your contribution. 10

ADV. SOLOMON: Mr. Chairman, may I express the appreciation of my clients and myself that you sat late today to accommodate the Reverend Mogoba.

THE COMMISSION IS ADJOURNED